

PICTURING WINTERREISE: FRANZ SCHUBERT'S SONG CYCLE IN ART

Perhaps the single-most striking exemplar in nineteenth century European art of the lone figure in nature is the painting by Caspar David Friedrich (1774-1840) *Der Wanderer über dem Nebelmeer* (The Wanderer Above the Mists) ca.1817/1818. The painting of the wanderer with his back turned to the viewer and facing the misty crags below him has been reproduced numerous times in our contemporary era, to the point of cliché, as emblematic of modern man's alienation.ⁱ Often used as the theme of man in his private existential agony living in nature and yet pitted against it, Friedrich's wanderer has found even greater resonance in Franz Schubert's song cycle *Winterreise*. During three years of research on a Franz Schubert portrait iconography, I discovered that a small segment of the artists in the iconography inventory had produced original artwork inspired by Schubert's *Winterreise*.ⁱⁱ After the iconography manuscript was published, I continued the search for more artists who had produced *Winterreise* artwork.

This survey of *Winterreise* art concentrates on the visual arts and includes painting, drawing, etching, illustration, printmaking, ceramic, sculpture, textile, silhouette work, artist books, and so on. In the section "Contemporary Explorations of *Winterreise*," there are late 20th and early 21st century explorations of the *Winterreise* theme in theatre, dance/ballet, opera, film, video, photography and staged performance. The growing number of examples of *Winterreise* art in contemporary explorations beyond the visual arts is noted because of the song cycle's impact on scenery, costume, and dramatic interpretation for which a visual record was made, usually a photographic one – still shots, film and/or video – and posters and other advertising media.

The initial iconography group of forty-one grew to 146 authenticated living and dead artists. There remains a list of twenty-eight unauthenticated names in this research effort. One cannot help but be deeply impressed by the number of artists, of twenty-nine nationalities among the authenticated and unauthenticated artists, who created the array and variety of *Winterreise* art. The tally by sex for the authenticated artists is ninety-five male and fifty-one female artists. Of the 146 authenticated artists in this inventory with a known birth year, 139 were born in the 20th century: 132 were born since 1920, 100 were born since 1940, and sixty-two were born since 1950. The oldest living artist in this inventory was born in 1919.ⁱⁱⁱ

Friedrich's *Wanderer* has also become a favorite theme in contemporary illustration and graphic art as a symbol of the era of early German Romanticism -- Schubert's era. While cover art used for 78rpm, LP, and CD recordings of the song cycle are acknowledged as another avenue for creative *Winterreise* art, the illustrators and artists of recording cover art generally remain anonymous. The absence of these artists is a glaring one and the hope is that this can be rectified in future.

Although multimedia performance appears to be a contemporary invention, the artist Moritz von Schwind (1804-1871) was commissioned in 1849 to produce wall drawings about Beethoven in a private music room. According to the plan, during the viewing of the frescoes Beethoven's Choral Fantasy, op. 80, would be heard. In 1862, Schwind, an old and dear friend of Schubert who created many images of the composer during Schubert's lifetime and after, had also planned a Schubert room, with a fresco commemorating Schubert but with no mention of a musical accompaniment.^{iv} The Schubert room, like the Beethoven room, never became a reality.

The creative energies of many visual artists seem to have been sparked by contact with and knowledge of one of music's most sadly stirring and gripping adventures into the human soul. This survey of such artistic output is recognition of the depths from which visual artists responded to Schubert's song cycle. At this point the musical inspiration itself should be examined through a brief history of Schubert's song cycle, its introduction to the music public, and a look at the place the song cycle has reached in music and the wider culture.

In his short life Vienna-born and -educated Franz Schubert (1797-1828) produced a significant body of over 600 songs in a relatively new genre known as *Lieder*, which he set to the poetry of 110 poets.⁵ The poets Schubert selected ranged from the ancient to the modern of his own era; from the greats -- Goethe, Schiller, Heine, and Shakespeare (the Englishman was translated into German) -- to a number of now-forgotten German poets from whom Schubert used only one poem. In the poems of Wilhelm Müller (1794-1827), Schubert found a resonance and inspiration, which the composer then set into two song cycles, *Winterreise* and *Die schöne Müllerin*. *Schwanengesang*, a collection of fourteen of Schubert's songs set to poems by Heinrich Heine, Ludwig Rellstab, and Johann Gabriel Seidl, was not a song cycle as such but the creation of Tobias Haslinger, the Vienna music publisher of *Winterreise* who published the *Schwanengesang* collection, with that title, about a year after Schubert's death. Despite their almost exactly contemporaneous life years, Schubert and Müller apparently never met and never knew each other. The persistent judgment of many early and modern critics has been that Müller, although acknowledged for his classical education and noted translations from Greek, was something of a second-rate German poet, basically one of poetry's nonentities, described as "simple and naïve."⁶ The early critique of Schubert's choice of poets was in place with Robert Schumann's unhappiness about this aspect of Schubert's *Lieder*. Schumann characterized Müller the poet as "easygoing."⁷ Schubert's transformation of Müller's poetry into the *Winterreise* cycle may not alter the opinion of some scholars and critics that such second-rate poetical stuff would have best been left alone. Schubert did not leave the stuff alone. What Schubert read in Müller were the themes of despair, hopelessness, loneliness, and the baseness of nature. What Schubert imagined and portrayed was Müller's figure of the lone and friendless wanderer journeying across a winter-blasted landscape, seeking and not finding. The interior vision of that shadowy figure must have had a profound impact on Schubert, coming as it did at a point in his life when he was struggling with the more aggressive symptoms of his earlier infection with syphilis. How could Schubert not have wondered about his ultimate fate with an incurable disease?

In recollections of his dear friend Schubert, Josef von Spaun (1788-1865) recalled that Schubert invited him to join a group of friends to hear the song cycle sung by Schubert himself. After finishing the last of the songs, Schubert said: "I like these songs more than all the others and you will get to like them too."⁸ The first interpreter of *Winterreise* as well as of many of Schubert's *Lieder* was the Vienna opera singer, baritone Johann Michael Vogl (1768-1840). Vogl is often described in German sources as being either a tenor or a baritone. He may have been described in the older usage as a tenor-baritone, meaning a high baritone. By the time he met Schubert in 1817, Vogl's voice may have deepened and darkened and, according to contemporary accounts from Schubert's friends, Vogl had reached the end of his singing prime. Vogl's overly dramatic interpretations of Schubert's *Lieder* have been viewed as either authoritative, with Schubert himself providing the imprimatur, or as taking unwarranted liberties. What were thought to be Vogl's vocal liberties were probably consistent with accepted late 18th and early 19th century

embellishment, ornamentation, and declamatory singing style with which Vogl was undoubtedly familiar. This also spoke to his era's acceptance of highly theatricalized vocal performance. Vogl was, after all, an opera singer and a man of the theatre. As well, declamatory singing was very much a feature of ballad singing, popular in this era, in which declamation and ornamentation were integral to the dramatic story being sung/told. Then again, Vogl's faded voice may have necessitated his taking on melodramatic vocal effects, such as whispers, to substitute for his inability to sing in his formerly robust fashion. As for another contemporary interpreter, Schubert himself had only great praise for the singing of baritone Baron Karl von Schönstein (1797-1875), a highly trained amateur of noble rank. In January 1828, Tobias Haslinger published the first part of *Winterreise*; the second part was published in December 1828, weeks after Schubert's death. The public now had access to the entire song cycle, and in this era of *Hausmusik* the musical audience of skilled amateurs had the opportunity to acquaint itself intimately with the poetry and the music. In reporting on Schubert's reception between 1831 and 1864, the *Wiener Zeitung* had over thirty entries pertaining to *Winterreise* -- announcements of availability of the sheet music for the entire song cycle. Later announcements followed for sheet music for each song, for Liszt's piano transcription of twelve selected songs from the cycle, as well as for piano and violin arrangements and a guitar version of one song by other composers.⁹

The popularity of Schubert's music and his Lieder spread beyond the borders of Habsburg Vienna to the rest of Germany and then to England and France.¹⁰ As early as 1834, French music publishers published translations of the songs. In the mid-1830s, Schubert's songs were sung in Paris in public and privately in salons by the famed tenor Adolphe Nourrit (1802-1839), whose audience included Liszt, Chopin, Meyerbeer, Berlioz, Heine, and many other French and Polish notables, nobles, artists, poets, and musicians.¹¹ The Austrian bass Josef Staudigl (1807-1861) regularly visited London in the 1840s and as part of his recitals, he sang many Schubert Lieder. However, it is not known if Staudigl sang any songs from *Winterreise*.¹² In 1839, the year before his death, Vogl sang the entire *Winterreise* in a private performance.¹³ It was in 1839 that Franz Liszt (1811-1886) transcribed twelve of the *Winterreise* songs for piano two-hands.¹⁴ Sheet music sales of Schubert's *Winterreise* apparently maintained a steady level over the years, as with his other Lieder, before the advent of recording technology.

In the late 19th century, singer Amalie Joachim (1839-1899), a leading exponent and promoter of the songs of Brahms, developed a recital series that was illustrative of the history of German song -- folk song as well as art song -- from the 15th century up to her own era. The published four-volume series, edited by music historian Heinrich Reimann (1850-1906) who worked closely with Joachim, included only one song cycle -- Beethoven's *An die ferne Geliebte*. Among the seven of Schubert's songs enshrined in Joachim's *Programm-Verzeichniss der historischen Lieder-Abende* was *Der Lindenbaum*, the fifth song in the *Winterreise* cycle. Evidence of Joachim's early commitment to this song is on a concert program of Joachim's 1871 recital in which *Der Lindenbaum* is the only Schubert song on the program. On that evening the stage was shared with Clara Schumann although Joachim was accompanied by another pianist.¹⁵ Amalie Joachim followed her own historical precepts and in 1891, adding to her recital schedule at home, began to tour abroad including visits to Russia and the USA to present her recitals.

In the early years of phonograph recording, starting ca. 1897, selections from *Winterreise* were a staple of Schubert Lieder recorded on shellac, which undoubtedly reflected the repertoires of the

singers recorded.¹⁶ For the period of shellac phonograph recordings, the single-most widely recorded selection from the cycle was *Der Lindenbaum* (D911/5). It is not surprising, therefore, to find that since it was first published German speakers have given *Der Lindenbaum* the heroic mantle of a beloved folk melody. This resonance came from a simpler melody with a truncated and re-worked text based on Schubert's *Der Lindenbaum* transmuted into a highly popular version known as *Am Brunnen vor dem Tore* by Philipp Friedrich Silcher (1789-1860), written around 1846 for male chorus. The Silcher version is still included today in the German male choral repertory and appears regularly in recordings and books of German folk songs. The popularity of both the Schubert and Silcher versions reflect the Germans' deep historical, cultural, and symbolic attachments to the linden tree, which found its way into popular art, such as a World War I German soldiers' 1917 charity donation card titled "Am Brunnen vor dem Tore" with the image of a traveler passing a fountain next to a linden tree where in the distance is seen a village gate. In the late twentieth century, the classically-trained Greek popular singer Nana Mouskouri included *Der Lindenbaum* in her 2004 32-CD collection of 675 popular, folk, and art songs sung in their original languages: French, Greek, German, and English. Mouskouri is noted for her vast repertoire and for her sell-out international tours, which bring her performances before a larger audience than that found for any Lieder recital. Her fans buy her recordings and CDs with dependable regularity. Undoubtedly, an international audience of pop music fans unfamiliar with *Winterreise* has become familiar with this one song - *Der Lindenbaum*, and very likely in the Silcher version - to the exclusion of the cycle's other twenty-three songs.

In another facet of the cycle, *Winterreise* melds with the image of the wanderer, a powerful symbol in German culture. These two deeply embedded German cultural emblems -- the linden tree and the wanderer (as personified by Caspar David Friedrich and others in the art, poetry, and literature of the German Romantic movement) -- are central to *Winterreise*. The iconic status of each of these emblems is noted in a modern illustrated edition of German folk songs, with music and text, in which Schubert's *Der Lindenbaum* is followed five pages later by *Wer recht in Freuden wandern will*, its text accompanied by the image of Friedrich's *Der Wanderer über dem Nebelmeer*.¹⁷ Given the long availability of sheet music during and since Schubert's lifetime, the popularity of Lieder recitals in the 19th and 20th century, and the widespread impact of recordings for well over one hundred years, one may ask why *Winterreise*-inspired art had been so late in making an appearance? *Winterreise* is possibly the most recorded song cycle of any composer; the first known recording of the complete cycle was in 1928. In 2007, the Schubert Institute-United Kingdom (SIUK) published online its updated discography of *Winterreise* and identified 467 recorded performances (studio, live and pirated issues and arrangements) of the complete cycle in all formats. DVD format has also begun to expand in number and variety for the cycle. The most frequently recorded *Winterreise* by a single artist belongs to the great German baritone Dietrich Fischer-Dieskau (b.1925), with twenty-three recorded studio and live performances listed in the SIUK *Winterreise* discography. Fischer-Dieskau is said to have painted *Winterreise*-related art but these works referred to a "figurative sphere, not to a musical one."*

* Erik Battaglia, "Schubert, Fischer-Dieskau and the Poetic of Freedom: Thoughts on *Die schöne Müllerin* and the Strophic Song," page 2n3, 2005, unpublished paper. My thanks to Prof. Battaglia for this information. Fischer-Dieskau's *Winterreise* images have not been found online or in a published print source.

Research continues to update the *Winterreise* discography. The standard *Winterreise* discographies refer to the vocal recordings of classically trained singers. Late in the 20th century, however, instrumentalists and young singers in classical, jazz, and contemporary genres have delved into *Winterreise*, and in a few instances some of these contemporary artists relied solely on Müller's poems from which to fashion their own compositions, beyond the musical orbit of Schubert.

The iconic status of the song cycle in its traditional form and its audience drawing power are reflected in the increasing appearance in the late twentieth century of accompanists who are also pianists on the recital stage with solo reputations in their own right pursuing their own separate performing and recording careers. In the history of live and recorded *Winterreise* performance, the preponderance of the piano accompanists made their careers as just that -- highly skilled and accomplished pianists whose reputations were as sought-after accompanists, and deliberately so. These accompanists often taught piano, voice, and Lieder, and, in our contemporary era, many still do. The acknowledgement of and applause for the accompanist at performance's end has always been a given. Yet, many contemporary *Winterreise* performances are now "two headliner" recitals with as much attention being paid to the piano accompaniment and the pianist as to the vocal performance. And deservedly so, since Schubert's music is his original contribution to the work -- the setting of the poet's text. It is, of course, the brilliance with which the composer captured the song's mood, color, emotion, and visual imagery in the piano line that informs the words.

The past great creative partnerships of Lieder singer and pianist are generally only known from the memoirs of the individuals involved. The metamorphosis of the accompanist from a single mention on the program to a major focus in a critical review as equal partner in the creation of the performance is evidence that *Winterreise*, and Lieder in general, had long ago moved onto a higher plane of musical art, into a genuine and profound collaborative esthetic experience. Parenthetically, older LP jackets and CD covers reflect low numbers in original art. In recent times, the image of the featured singer has been on the cover. For the past two decades, we see more and more photographic images of the featured singer and his/her famous accompanist.

In the fine arts, *Winterreise* artwork appeared with increasing frequency since the end of World War Two with the expected spike in number of artists and works in 1996 and 1997 as Schubert's 1997 birth bicentennial was celebrated. Some artists produced a single work; others produced a series a several related works; yet others produced a series of twenty-four works depicting the twenty-four songs in the cycle. The visual artists in this inventory have worked in oil, watercolor, acrylic, mixed media, pen and ink, colored pencil, crayon, scissors, woodcut, etching, pastel, lithography, photography, video, sculpture, installation, linocut, and textile. No single medium, therefore, dominates the sphere of *Winterreise* visual art.

Recalling the Friedrich painting in the opening paragraph, the winter landscape was not exclusively a North German Romantic preoccupation. Such winter scenes were known from Dutch paintings of the 17th century, for example, with skating scenes on frozen canals or hunters trekking through a deep snowfall. The French Impressionist movement documented the self-same fascination and curiosity about a landscape transmogrified into another world, with manmade and natural features covered with snow and a view now smoothed out, altered,

whitened, bare. The Impressionist emphases on winter light and a subtler seasonal color palette were their preeminent concerns. The Impressionists viewed the natural world in winter as a place and time where people made an accommodation to a change in the seasons.

In the 19th century France experienced a long period of adverse winter weather patterns with blizzards and heavy snowfalls, including several severely cold and snowy winters in 1879-80 and 1890-91. French Impressionist art documented the impact of these adverse conditions on people's lives yet the overall tone of their painting was one portraying this seasonal transformation in a painterly manner, with no seeming commentary. Within 19th century North German Romanticism, artists used the historically harsh winter landscape of that part of Germany to convey a moral or spiritual message during a period in which these artists were experiencing an unsettling change of cultural values. As in the rest of their society, German artists felt a seismic shift in their spiritual lives and painted the harsh, bare winter landscape as a template for the moral education of society.

A curious juxtaposition of an image of Schubert and a winter landscape is in a painting known simply as *Schubert in einer Winterlandschaft* by Viennese artist Otto Robert Nowak (1874- or 1875-1945). This painting also appeared in a postcard series (probably early 20th century), attesting to Schubert's popularity with the Viennese public. The landscape in the distance is snow-covered and barren. The composer is standing in the foreground and seen from a rear view, below a slightly rising snowy hill with a few sere hedges and brown, leafless trees. He is walking away from the viewer. In this bleak winter scene, Schubert is wearing a coat, muffler, tall hat, and his famous round spectacles. He has turned his head to peer over his left shoulder at the viewer with a rather expressionless look. Unlike Friedrich's faceless wanderer standing above the mists with his back to the viewer, this wandering Schubert looks back. However, the viewer is provided no clue or message from Schubert's blank stare. The scene is every bit as haunting as the music of the song cycle. While Nowak was not an artist of the Romantic generation, Schubert and his *Winterreise* have been brought together in a single, stirring visual moment.¹⁸

In my Schubert Iconography, distinct differences emerged among artists in favoring one or more mediums for their art. Notably, thirteen German and Austrian artists in the Iconography favored the use of *Scherenschnitt*, or silhouette art, as part of their work or as the sole medium in which they worked. In Europe, this form began in the 17th century and became very popular in the 18th and 19th centuries in both Europe and North America, among upper class and later among middle class producers and consumers of this artwork. Silhouette art took on the function of applied art as new technologies enabled the transfer of the silhouette to a variety of household and commercial items. While silhouette art has all but disappeared as a popular art form, it is still followed in many countries as well as by many German-speaking artists. Indeed, there is a museum in Germany dedicated to silhouette art and an organization of silhouette artists -- the *Deutscher Scherenschnittverein*. Silhouette artists number many non-professionals in their ranks since this pursuit has retained its place as a form of skilled amateur art. It is not surprising then that such a silhouette artist appears in the *Winterreise* inventory and is Austrian. The same applies to collage work in which four artists in this inventory are found to favor this medium, in part or in whole, two German, one Austrian, and one Spaniard. Both mediums -- silhouette and collage -- are still popular in German-speaking countries for many of the same reasons: they are old and respected types of popular art and are also found in fine art; they are able to be produced

by those without formal art training; the home was usually the destination for displaying this art; it did not have the association of being high art nor was it costly to produce; silhouette art could be used to create portraits of family members, much as photography did later; amateur silhouette and collage artists were able to attain a highly refined and sophisticated level in their work which did not set them apart from professional working artists. Also, many fine art photographers appear in the inventory as evidence that the scope of the arts has broadened, warranting photography as one of the visual arts.

It is my belief that the artists themselves should be allowed speak about the process of creating *Winterreise* art. Non-German-speaking visual artists may be familiar with the poetry in translation. Certainly, the mood of the songs and the cumulative impact of the twenty-four songs sung over a single hour create an experience into which the visual artist moves. In this instance, the creative process may also derive from a deep familiarity with the idea of *Winterreise* embedded in the cultural sphere in which the artists grew up and worked. In German-speaking countries, perhaps several preconditions apply simultaneously: the cultural ideas of the wanderer and of the winter journey combined in the song cycle itself, the reverence for Schubert, and the collateral popularity of *Der Lindenbaum / Am Brunnen vor dem Tore*.

In the early years of research, before I put the project aside, in order to know the artist's own personal thinking I circulated a questionnaire to as many artists as could be contacted. As would be expected, not every artist could be located and of those who were contacted, not every one of the artists chose to respond to the initial query. When I resumed the research some four years later, I abandoned the questionnaire. However, when I was able to find a statement online about the *Winterreise* work or other relevant source information, I extracted the artist's words or thoughts where appropriate. The artists' entries in this inventory are brief, as they would be in an art lexicon, with minimal biographical information. In many instances, literature about an artist and a brief description and listing of the artist's *Winterreise* exhibits have been included to assist further research.

To turn to the question posed above asking why there was such a late appearance of art inspired by *Winterreise*, the artists themselves did not (and, perhaps, could not) respond to this question. In doing an elementary cross-tabulation regarding the birth years of this group of artists, I find that *Winterreise*-inspired art is a late-20th century phenomenon, much of the impetus being, of course, the Schubert 1997 birth bicentennial. In the absence of asking artists directly and specifically for their historical perspective of movements in the visual arts, one can only assume that their art is as embedded in the cultural, political, and social matrixes of their own times as any other tendency. A few of the artists suggested that the 20th century itself was the prime key to such art production. While the artists did not expand on this choice, this refers, of course, to a 20th century noted for two devastating world wars; rapid and unsettling social change; far-reaching scientific, technological, and industrial developments; rising mass political parties whose intent was to effect a sole and total concentration of state power; cataclysmic wartime destruction of cities and their civilian populations; the phenomenon of the slaughter of "inferior peoples" like Jews, Gypsies and others in concentration camps and of post-World War II so-called ethnic cleansing; the atomic bomb; and now, added to the atomic arsenal with its concept of mutually assured destruction, is the use of biological and chemical weaponry. As the 20th century neared its turning, was there some sort of fin de siècle sensibility taking place?

This research has noted the changing reception of *Winterreise* over the 19th and 20th century. Also noted is that *Winterreise* far outpaced Schubert's other song cycle *Die schöne Müllerin* in the number of recorded performances, beginning in 1928 when both cycles began to be recorded. Many of the same singers recorded both cycles. In early 2004, 131 recordings of all versions of *Die schöne Müllerin* by 109 singers with another eleven unreleased recordings have been identified whereas 467 recordings by 293 singers of the complete *Winterreise* cycle are known, including instrumental versions (for orchestra, small ensemble, string quartet, solo performer, guitar, cello and viola), incomplete cycles of *Winterreise* produced since 1940, and versions that SIUK cites as questionable.¹⁹ Original art inspired by *Die schöne Müllerin*, including record covers, is practically non-existent. The impact of the *Winterreise* cycle reached a new point in the 2005 novel *Winterreise.Roman* by the Luxembourg theatre professor, writer and critic Guy Wagner whose work received Luxembourg's prize award in the 2004/2005 national literature competition.²⁰

While it has sometimes been sung (and recorded) in English, Russian, Japanese, Swedish, Dutch and Latvian, *Winterreise* in German is today adjudged the consummate expression of great Lieder and supreme Schubert. In the song cycle are entwined the composer's incomparable music and Müller's text which together create a profound depth of human emotion and real psychological intuition. *Winterreise* has become the gold standard for a Lieder singer and a prime musical experience for people around the world. The caption on a Welsh newspaper review termed it the "Everest of vocal art."²¹

CONCLUSION

One leaves a performance of *Winterreise* in tears, breathless, drained of emotion. For some, the experience of listening to the recording approximates these feelings. Nothing, however, can replicate the impact of a live performance. The blasted frigid snowscape of *Winterreise* represents nature at its most unrelenting, and the song cycle's wanderer, with his ice-clutched heart, would not endure for long winter's grip on his mind and soul. The audience accompanies the wanderer until the end – his end – with the *Der Leiermann*, the old hurdy-gurdy man, barefoot on the ice, waiting for the wanderer.

The song cycle has been analyzed and interpreted over and over, from both a musical and a poetic point of view -- and indeed analyzed in terms of the word-music unity and relationship. Even if the visual artist has little or nothing to say of the inspiration for the *Winterreise* art, does bringing the music and visual art together say something more than has been said about each separately?

In the late 20th and early 21st century *Winterreise* has entered the creative domains of film, video, ballet/dance, opera and performance art. There are now interpreted dramatic presentations with music. *Winterreise* is unique in the joining of music and art in that the song cycle has inspired so large a number of artworks. *Winterreise* the song cycle existed as an independent expression of the art of *Lieder* long before a known *Lieder*-inspired creation in the visual arts came into existence. The artwork came late in the song cycle's performance and reception histories

although the cycle was composed and performed in the late 1820s, just before Schubert's death. We know that Schubert's image was pictured voluminously, beginning within his own lifetime. How do we account for the late appearance of *Winterreise* art when contrasted with the enormous number of Schubert images created over 180 years? Tentative answer: Schubert's fame grew slowly; the 1897 birth centenary was the first great Austrian recognition, on a national scale, that they possessed a great composer as part of their national music patrimony, and one with a growing international reputation. With the 1928 death centenary, Schubert's fame and greatness were indisputably international, witness the commemorative events taking place in Europe and the USA that year.

What grew with greater rapidity but only started at the end of the 19th century was the technology of sound reproduction. This technology (actually several linked technologies) matched the means of making better and more aurally faithful sound recordings as well as packaging the sound for the mass consumer market whose consumers would purchase the machines upon which to play the product. The sound revolution, which moved from the Edison era of wax cylinders to gramophone shellac disks and later to 78s, LPs, tape, CDs, and mp3 is still going strong. The technological developments had to keep pace with other elements of technology such as recording materials, electric and later electronic circuitry, and so on. The wind-up gramophone and the iPod are merely decades apart.

Winterreise art is a 20th century phenomenon, which has moved forward into the 21st century, with a multiplicity of overlapping reasons by which to account for it. Therefore, the reasons for the start of this phenomenon need to be located in 20th century history but with an understanding as well of the 19th century precursors, which laid the groundwork for the creation of such a specific genre. *Winterreise* art represents the temporal and enduring image of an aural art - music - cast into tactile form by visual artists with their sensitivity to the music and the poetry, by artists who live in a society affected profoundly by their century's staggering events, artists who were changed by their troubling era simply by living during its time.

Epilogue: *Winterreise* art is the incarnation of that intersection of poetry, music and art where the visual artist's profound emotional response to the music and poetry is transformed into a creative act of immense daring, an act in which the artist is revealed as well as the art. To trust in the truth of Schubert's *Winterreise* is to trust in the truth of art.

ⁱ A survey via Google on October 4, 2005 found 6,300 *Winterreise* images listed online (including CD covers, and travel agency ads for wintertime vacations and ski trips); on February 13, 2009, there were 36,000 listed. In 2003, there were 125 images of *Der Wanderer über dem Nebelmeer* by Caspar David Friedrich; on February 13, 2009 there were 457 images. Regarding the *Wanderer*, one striking example (found on February 16, 2003 and apparently gone from the Internet as of this writing) is a May 1995 cover of *Der Spiegel* using Friedrich's *Wanderer*, standing over and above images of Adolf Hitler, concentration camp inmates, massed Nazi flags, and Berlin's triumphal arch - the Brandenburg Gate - all swirling in the mists, to commemorate the fall of Berlin and the end of World War II. In my July 2005 visit to the Hamburger Kunsthalle I found the painting of *Der Wanderer über dem Nebelmeer* to be surprisingly smaller than I had anticipated. So familiar is its image and so profound its visual impact that something on a larger scale is what I expected to see. See also John Leighton and Colin J. Bailey, *Caspar David Friedrich. Winter Landscape*, ex.cat. The National Gallery, London, 28 March-28 May, 1990.

ⁱⁱ See: Janet I. Wasserman, "A Schubert Iconography: Painters, Sculptors, Lithographers, Illustrators, Silhouettists, Engravers, and Others Known or Said to Have Produced a Likeness of Franz Schubert," in *Music in Art*;

International Journal for Music Iconography, [City University of New York, Research Center for Music Iconography], XXVIII, 1-2, 2003, pages 199-241.

ⁱⁱⁱ The dead artists - in birth order - are Otto Robert Nowak (1874- or 1875-1945); Paul Klee (1879-1940); Lotte Lehmann (1888-1976); Joseph Probst (1911-1997); Wilfrid Moser (1914-1997); Henry Koerner (1915-1991); James Gleeson (1915-2008); Godfried Lonis (1916-2007); Friedrich (Fritz) Heppner (1917-2002); Hens (Hermina) Jong (1927-2003); Aimée Crince Le Roy (1928-2008); Ken Kiff (1935-2001); Kees Spermon (1941-1992); Janet Brooks Gerloff (1947-2008). The birth/death years of several authenticated artists have yet to be established. Internet research on this project provided the unique experience of discovering a completely unknown artist who produced *Winterreise* artwork. In addition, the artist's life chronology was readily available online along with a brief statement of the circumstances that impelled him to create his work. This artist, Alfred Hoos, is the fictional creation of Greek playwright, poet, novelist, and filmmaker Apostolos Doxiadis (see inventory). Doxiadis did, in fact, produce the *Winterreise* artwork himself claiming his fictional character Hoos as the creator. As regards his familiarity with Schubert and the song cycle, Doxiadis said that he learned to sing *Der Lindenbaum* in Greek (*I Flamouria*, meaning the linden tree) as an eight-year-old schoolboy in Athens and that he has been in love with the song and the composer ever since. Beyond merely loving the song, Doxiadis has a linden tree in his garden and, in the time-honored German and French traditions, has used the linden blossoms to make an infusion of herbal tea. While Doxiadis created a plausible fiction, which echoes the works and the words of the real artists, he created a parallel *Winterreise* reality, but one which does not make his own artwork, although allegedly from the easel of Hoos, any less valid. I chose to add an entry for the fictional Alfred Hoos at the end of the real Doxiadis entry if only to indicate the cultural and artistic impact that Schubert's song cycle made in a most unexpected way.

^{iv} Otto Stoessel, ed., *Moritz von Schwind: Briefe*, (Bibliographisches Institut, 1924), pages 253-254, 401.

^v Susan Youens, "Schubert and His Poets: Issues and Conundrums," in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Christopher H. Gibbs (Cambridge University Press, 1997), pages 99-117.

⁶ Susan Youens, *Retracing a Winter's Journey. Schubert's Winterreise*, (Cornell University Press, 1991), page 55; "simple and naïve" is Youens quoting others - this does not appear to be her own assessment.

⁷ A more complete survey is Susan Youens, *Retracing a Winter's Journey*. See "Genesis and Sources," pages 3-49; John Daverio, *Crossing Paths: Schubert, Schumann, & Brahms*, (Oxford University Press, 2002), pages 16, 255n21; "easygoing" is not otherwise explained.

⁸ Otto Erich Deutsch, ed., *Schubert: Memoirs by His Friends*, (Macmillan, 1958), page 138.

⁹ Ernst Hilmar, "Zur Schubert-Rezeption in den Jahren 1831 bis 1865: Eine kommentierte Auflistung der Quellen in der 'Wiener Zeitung'," *Schubert durch die Brille*, 29, June 2002, pages 67-227. The journal *Hofmeister: Musikalisch-literarischer Monatsbericht*, started in 1829 by Leipzig music publisher Friedrich Hofmeister, the monthly/bi-monthly catalogue of contemporary 19th century printed music, now digitized online, is invaluable for tracking the publication of *Winterreise*, by song and by full cycle. Published individual *Winterreise* songs and the complete cycle appeared in *Hofmeister* from a variety of publishers in Germany and Austria, some with French texts, over a span of decades in April 1829; July 1838 – Liszt piano transcriptions; May 1840; May 1842; July 1843; June 1853; December 1855; March 1857; March 1859; January 1868; March 1868; January 1869; February 1870; May-June 1878; November 1878; November 1888; November 1894. See: <www.hofmeister.rhul.ac.uk/2008/>.

¹⁰ Christopher H. Gibbs, "German Reception: Schubert's 'journey to immortality'," in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Christopher H. Gibbs, (Cambridge University Press, 1997), pages 241-253; John Reed, "Schubert's Reception History in Nineteenth-Century England," in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Christopher H. Gibbs, (Cambridge University Press, 1997), pages 254-262; Xavier Hascher, "Schubert's Reception in France: a Chronology (1828-1928)," in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Christopher H. Gibbs, (Cambridge University Press, 1997), pages 263-269; Till Gerrit Waidelich, " 'Begegnungen eines deutschen Tenors' mit Schubert. Carl Adam Baders Tagebücher als Quelle der Berliner Schubert-Rezeption von 1825-1866," *Schubert durch die Brille*, 13, June 1994, pages 55-66; Werner Bodendorff, "Einige Anmerkungen zur Schubert-Rezeption in Ödenburg," *Schubert durch die Brille*, 13, June 1994, pages 67-69.

¹¹ Adam Zamoyski, *Chopin; A New Biography*, (Doubleday & Co., 1980), pages 129, 145 et seq., 157; *The Great Tenor Tragedy. The Last Days of Adolphe Nourrit as Told by Himself*, ed., annot., introd. Henry Pleasants, (Amadeus Press, 1995), *passim*.

¹² Dietrich Fischer-Dieskau, *Schubert's Songs: A Biographical Study* trans. Kenneth S. Whitton, (Alfred A. Knopf, 1981), pages 303-314, in which the singer provides a brief historical overview of some of Schubert's interpreters; David Montgomery, "Franz Schubert's Music in Performance: a Brief History of People, Events, and Issues," in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Christopher H. Gibbs, (Cambridge University Press, 1997), pages 270-283, discusses Schubert's singers. Montgomery briefly discusses reports of Vogl's embellishments of Schubert's Lieder in

"Franz Schubert's Scores: Meticulous Documents or Informal Springboards for Improvisation?," in *Schubert durch die Brille*, 23, June 1999, pages 93-97. In his more recent book, *Franz Schubert's Music in Performance: Compositional Ideals, Notational Intent, Historical Realities, Pedagogical Foundations*, Monographs in Musicology No.11, (Pendragon Press, 2003), Montgomery expands on what he calls "The 'Sound' of Schubert's Lieder," on pages 15-30, discussing vocal style and technique. Montgomery provides an especially rich resource in the names of Schubert singers, both amateur and professional, who were active in the composer's lifetime, many of whom Schubert accompanied personally, on pages 17-19. Another scholar's estimate of Schubert Lieder performance can be found in Eric Van Tassel, "Something Utterly New': Listening to Schubert Lieder. 1. Vogl and the Declamatory Style," *Early Music*, November 1997, 25/4, pages 703-714, and his more recent lecture, "Something Utterly New': Reconstructing an Early Performance Style in Schubert's Songs," at the City University of New York Graduate Center, October 21, 2004, in which Van Tassel continues this exploration. Julius Stockhausen (1826-1906) sang excerpts from *Winterreise* in London, 1851. Thereafter he sang the complete cycle *Die schöne Müllerin* numerous times in public, Ernst Hilmar and Margret Jestremski, eds., *Schubert-Enzyklopädie*, (Hans Schneider Verlag, 2004), vol. 2, 732-733.

¹³ Deutsch, op.cit., page 5.

¹⁴ *The New Grove Dictionary of Music & Musicians*, ed. Stanley Sadie, (Macmillan, 1980/1995), vol. 11, Liszt Works. For a brief description of Liszt's Schubert Lieder transcriptions see Christopher H. Gibbs, "Beyond Song: Instrumental Transformations and Adaptations of the Lied from Schubert to Mahler," *Cambridge Companion to the Lied*, ed. James Parsons (Cambridge University Press, 2004), pages 225-226.

¹⁵ The *Programm-Verzeichniss* is reproduced in Beatrix Borchard, "Amalie Joachim und die gesungene Geschichte des deutschen Liedes," *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft*, 2001, 58/4, pages 292-293. The 1871 concert program is reproduced in Beatrix Borchard, "Die Sängerin Amalie Joachim und 'Die schöne Müllerin' von Franz Schubert," in *Frauen- und Männerbilder in der Musik. Festschrift für Eva Rieger zum 60. Geburtstag*, eds. Freia Hoffmann, Jane Bowers and Ruth Heckmann, (Bibliotheks- und Informationssystem der Universität Oldenburg, 2000), page 80. Joachim's accompanist was a pupil of Clara Schumann's, identified on the program as Fräulein von Asten. This pupil was Julie von Asten, who was Viennese; see Nancy B. Reich, *Clara Schumann: the Artist and the Woman*, rev.ed., (Cornell University Press, 2001), page 160.

¹⁶ *The Winterreise Discography* is by Ernest Johnson, (Schubert Institute-United Kingdom), assisted by Ted Perry, Hyperion Records, and Richard Morris (SIUK). Originally posted February 1998; latest revision 2007 at Half Times Scores for the SIUK, see: <www.halftimescores.co.uk/ography/performances.php?&fltCycle=W>. As of 2007, there were 467 entries for every version. Most of the discography researchers cooperate in sharing information.

Especially useful for the early years of shellac discs, 1897 to ca. 1962, is Karsten Lehl, "Zur Schubert-Diskographie: Nachweisbare Aufnahmen auf Shellack-Platten," in *Schubert durch die Brille*, 29, June 2002, 229-404. Lehl provides the information in tabular form so that the researcher can find an entry by work (by Deutsch number), singer, accompanist and instrument, conductor, record matrix number, and recording date. Lehl's table includes, where possible, the life years for the singers who might be otherwise unidentifiable.

In *The Magic Mountain*, Thomas Mann writes with some wit of the pre-World War I popularity of early gramophones and of the musical selections available on shellac. He also writes movingly of the "exemplarily German" song *Der Lindenbaum*: "simultaneously a masterpiece and a folk song....," Thomas Mann, *The Magic Mountain*, trans. John E. Woods, (Vintage Books, 1996), pages 640-641. In the closing pages of the novel, the main character Hans Castorp sings his favorite song, *Der Lindenbaum*, which he loved to play on the gramophone. In the novel's final lines, some of the verses from Wilhelm Müller's poem echo once more. Castorp is dead, clutching his rifle and bayonet with the mud clogging the soles of his hobnailed boots, a tragic victim of the Great War. As of February 13, 2009, Google shows 31,000 entries for Schubert's *Der Lindenbaum*.

¹⁷ Youens, *Retracing a Winter's Journey*, pages 151-169; David L. Mosley, "The Wanderer as Topic and Trope in Early Nineteenth-Century German Culture," in *Romanticism Across the Disciplines*, ed. Larry H. Peer, (University Press of America, 1998), pages 57-66; Heinz Rölleke, ed., *Das Volksliederbuch*, (Kiepenheuer & Witsch, 1993), pages 283, 288-289; J.W. Smeed, "The Fifth Song of *Winterreise*: 'Volksgut und Meisterwerk zugleich'," *Forum for Modern Language Studies*, January 2001, vol. 37, no. 1, pages 50-57.

¹⁸ Charles S. Moffett, et al., *Impressionists in Winter: Effets de Neige*, exh. catalogue, The Phillips Collection, Washington, DC, Sept. 19, 1998-Jan. 3, 1999, (Philip Wilson Publishers Ltd., 1999); Stephen F. Eisenman, et al., *Nineteenth Century Art: A Critical History*, (Thames and Hudson, 1996).

The Nowak work, auctioned in 2003 by the Dorotheum Wien, the famous Vienna auction house, is described as oil on cardboard, 50x72.5cm, no date, and framed. With thanks to Richard Morris who is the new owner of the Nowak

oil painting which image is online at: <www.halftimescores.co.uk/postcard/schart.html>. Mr. Morris, a collector of Schubertiana, is affiliated with the Schubert Institute (UK) and the Schubert Society of the USA.

¹⁹ With thanks to Huib Spoorenberg of the Netherlands for sharing with me both song cycle compilations. His earlier compilation of *Winterreise* is online at the web site of the Nederlandse Schubert Stichting (Netherlands Schubert Foundation), see: <www.schubert.nl/start.htm>. Mr. Spoorenberg provided his newest, up to date discographies of *Die schöne Müllerin* and *Winterreise*. He also provided source data on the earliest recordings of *Winterreise* songs: Ernest van Dijck, tenor (1861-1923). *Die Post* Paris 1905; Franz Naval (1865-1939). *Nebensonnen*: Wien 1905; U.A. Modestov, baritone (?). *Der Leiermann*: Moscow 1906/07; Anton van Rooy, baritone (1870-1932). *Der Lindenbaum*: USA 1906-07: *Source*: Robert Bauer, *The New Catalogue of Historical Records, 1898-1908/09*, (London: Sidgwick & Jackson, 1937; 2d ed. 1946).

Also my thanks to Peter Wilms in Germany who shared his *Winterreise* discography with me. His earlier list includes live performances as recorded at the performance venue and that are not commercial releases and his total has reached 306 entries; he is in the process of authenticating new additions. Mr. Wilms also researches the single recorded selections of the songs from the cycle, and his discography notes sixteen recordings on which *Der Lindenbaum* is the sole selection from *Winterreise*. Another authoritative and accessible compilation is that of the Schubert Institute (UK) at <<http://myweb.tiscali.co.uk/franzschubert/articles/wint.html>>. This site, created and managed by Richard Morris, is in a new stage of improvement that makes it an invaluable online search tool.

On any given day, *Winterreise* is sung in a live performance somewhere, whether or not it is recorded. It would be impossible to track the number of these performances accurately although the Internet is useful in noting the variety of venues, singers, and accompanists who perform the cycle.

20. Guy Wagner, *Winterreise.Roman*, (Phi Publishers, 2005).

21. Karen Price, " 'Everest of Vocal Arts' inspired opera star to a life in music," *Western Mail* (Cardiff, Wales), July 26, 2003, at <static.highbeam.com/w/westernmailcardiffwales/>. In mid-2006, came an announcement that all of Schubert's Lieder had been translated into Spanish; see Fernando Pérez Cárceles, *Los lieder de Schubert*, (Ediciones Hiperion, 2006), 3 vols. In his autobiographical memoir, German bass-baritone Thomas Quasthoff reminds the reader and the vocal student: "I have learned that a musician must do his homework, consult secondary literature, compare interpretations, and study the history and context of a work. But when he steps onto the stage he must present his own musical interpretation." Thomas Quasthoff, *The Voice. A Memoir*, recorded by Michael Quasthoff, transl. from the German by Kirsten Stoldt Wittenborn, (Pantheon, 2008).

ADDENDUM

Of the singers listed in the SIUK 2007 database of *Winterreise* performances, twenty-one have recorded the song cycle more than twice. These 147 recordings include commercial and "well-known pirate" recordings. Not included are the database identifications of "private, off air, non-commercial" recordings.

Dietrich Fischer-Dieskau (German; b.1925)	23
Thomas Quasthoff (German, b.1959)	14
Peter Schreier (German; b.1935)	12
Hans Hotter (German; 1909-2003)	11
Hermann Prey (German; 1929-1998)	9
Christa Ludwig (German; b.1928)	8
Matthias Goerne (German; b.1967)	8
Robert Holl (Dutch; b.1947)	7
Francisco Araiza (Mexican; b.1950)	6
Ian Bostridge (English; b.1964)	6
Thomas Hampson (American; b.1955)	5
Christoph Prégardien (German; 1956)	5
Roman Trekel (German; b.1963)	5
Gerard Souzay (French; 1918-2004)	4
Wolfgang Holzmair (Austrian; b.1952)	4
Ernst Haefliger (Swiss; 1919-2007)	4

Jorma Hynninen (Finnish; 1941)	4
Jose Van Dam (Belgian; 1940)	3
Brigitte Fassbaender (German; 1939)	3
Jon Vickers (Canadian; b.1926)	3
László Polgár (Hungarian; b.1947)	3